

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

22-01941 Christine Joann Fox

#1 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Christine Joann Fox (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

23-01732 Lee O. Powell and Elaine M. Powell

#2 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Mary S. Cohn, Atty for Elaine M. Powell (Debtor)
Mary S. Cohn, Atty for Lee O. Powell (Debtor)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Elaine M. Powell (Debtor)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Lee O. Powell (Debtor)
Vincent Edward Carlson, Atty for Elaine M. Powell (Debtor)
Vincent Edward Carlson, Atty for Lee O. Powell (Debtor)

24-02735 Thomas Frederick Drollinger

#3 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Ralph M. Reisinger, Atty for Thomas Frederick Drollinger (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

25-00001 David Wayne Skinner and Vanessa Marie Skinner

#4 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for David Wayne Skinner (Debtor)
Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Vanessa Marie Skinner (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

25-00333 Sandra I. Ryan and Shelly L. Ryan

#5 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Michael M. Malinowski, Atty for Sandra I. Ryan (Debtor)
Michael M. Malinowski, Atty for Shelly L. Ryan (Debtor)

25-02317 Kathleen A Bortolete

#6 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Michelle Marrs, Atty for Kathleen A Bortolete (Debtor)
Tricia S. Terry, Atty for Kathleen A Bortolete (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

25-03318 Randy E. Nettle
#7 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Ryan French Beach, Atty for Randy E. Nettle (Debtor)

25-03620 Damien Lee Jones, Sr and Sabrina Latima Jones
#8 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Damien Lee Jones Sr (Debtor)
Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Sabrina Latima Jones (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-00554 Justine Rochelle Lopez
#9 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

Jeremy Shephard, Atty for Justine Rochelle Lopez (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

26-00554 Justine Rochelle Lopez
#10 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Jeremy Shephard, Atty for Justine Rochelle Lopez (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-00655 Benjamin Williams and Ashley Williams
#11 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss

April A. Hulst, Atty for Ashley Williams (Debtor)
April A. Hulst, Atty for Benjamin Williams (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-00655 Benjamin Williams and Ashley Williams
#12 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

April A. Hulst, Atty for Ashley Williams (Debtor)
April A. Hulst, Atty for Benjamin Williams (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

- 26-00669 Nathan Tyler Seymour**
#13 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss
- Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Nathan Tyler Seymour (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
-
- 26-00669 Nathan Tyler Seymour**
#14 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.
- Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Nathan Tyler Seymour (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
-
- 23-01018 Brian S Tompkins**
#15 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Michelle Marrs, Atty for Brian S Tompkins (Debtor)
Tricia S. Terry, Atty for Brian S Tompkins (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

24-00751 Trey Michael Reidt and Alyssa Jo Catherine Reidt

#16 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Alyssa Jo Catherine Reidt (Debtor)
Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Trey Michael Reidt (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

24-02997 Michael R Struyk

#17 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Ryan French Beach, Atty for Michael R Struyk (Debtor)

24-03200 Alexis T. Cunningham

#18 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Roger G. Cotner, Atty for Alexis T. Cunningham (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

25-00284 Brianna Joann Reaume and Kyle Jordan Reaume

#19 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Brianna Joann Reaume (Debtor)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Kyle Jordan Reaume (Debtor)

25-00511 Nicholas Glen Skinner and Jodi Lynn Skinner

#20 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Jodi Lynn Skinner (Debtor)
Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Nicholas Glen Skinner (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

25-00595 Jason Ray Fuller

#21 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.

Aaron J. Kenyon, Atty for Jason Ray Fuller (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

COURT REPORTER: Digital

Thursday, June 18, 2026

HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

- 25-03446 Patricia Miller**
#22 Chapter 13 Trustee's Motion to Dismiss - Adj.
Bronte Kelley Reisinger, Atty for Patricia Miller (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
- 25-03446 Patricia Miller**
#23 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.
Bronte Kelley Reisinger, Atty for Patricia Miller (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
- 26-01031 Tyler Santiago**
#24 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
Bronte Kelley Reisinger, Atty for Tyler Santiago (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

**COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)**

09:00 AM

- 26-01048 Wilnese Isnady-Van Dyke**
#25 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
- David Ross Ienna, Atty for Wilnese Isnady-Van Dyke (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
-
- 26-01061 Barey Robert Schweitzer**
#26 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
- Jeremy Shephard, Atty for Barey Robert Schweitzer (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
-
- 26-01140 Scott A Pepper and Lynda J Pepper**
#27 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Maureen B. Van Hoven, Atty for Lynda J Pepper (Debtor)
Maureen B. Van Hoven, Atty for Scott A Pepper (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

**COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)**

09:00 AM

26-01186 Robert Allen Miller
#28 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Martin L. Rogalski, Atty for Robert Allen Miller (Debtor)

26-01217 Kathleen Jo Bordeaux
#29 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Kathleen Jo Bordeaux (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-01241 Cory Lamont Hardy and Michelle C. Hardy
#30 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Roger G. Cotner, Atty for Cory Lamont Hardy (Debtor)
Roger G. Cotner, Atty for Michelle C. Hardy (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

- 26-01277 Lisa Beth Versluys**
#31 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Morris B. Lefkowitz, Atty for Lisa Beth Versluys (Debtor)
-
- 26-01302 Emily Ann Firlit**
#32 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Stephen Jered Beard, Atty for Emily Ann Firlit (Debtor)
-
- 26-01307 David A. Boles and Cheryl J. Boles**
#33 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Michael M. Malinowski, Atty for Cheryl J. Boles (Debtor)
Michael M. Malinowski, Atty for David A. Boles (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

**COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)**

09:00 AM

- 26-01376 Aaron Shane Allen**
#34 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Aaron Shane Allen (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
- 26-00147 Carla Jean Vining**
#35 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Jeremy Shephard, Atty for Carla Jean Vining (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
- 26-00224 Shemeka Janell ONeal**
#36 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Shemeka Janell ONeal (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

26-00263 Rowlf L Hawkins, IV and Tamara L Hawkins
#37 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Kimberly S. Young, Atty for Rowlf L Hawkins IV (Debtor)
Kimberly S. Young, Atty for Tamara L Hawkins (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-00495 Andrew Scott Storey and Claire Judith Storey
#38 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Stephen Jered Beard, Atty for Andrew Scott Storey (Debtor)
Stephen Jered Beard, Atty for Claire Judith Storey (Debtor)

26-00500 William B. Sherman and Kali L. Sherman
#39 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Greg J. Ekdahl, Atty for Kali L. Sherman (Debtor)
Greg J. Ekdahl, Atty for William B. Sherman (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

26-00552 Bryan F McCrackin
#40 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

David Ross Ienna, Atty for Bryan F McCrackin (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-00626 Kelby Dennis Clockman and Michelle Rose Clockman
#41 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Kelby Dennis Clockman (Debtor)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Michelle Rose Clockman (Debtor)
Vincent Edward Carlson, Atty for Kelby Dennis Clockman (Debtor)
Vincent Edward Carlson, Atty for Michelle Rose Clockman (Debtor)

26-00813 James Gregory Dart
#42 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Rebecca L. Johnson-Ellis, Atty for James Gregory Dart (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

**COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)**

09:00 AM

26-00880 Jen L. Wixom
#43 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Ryan French Beach, Atty for Jen L. Wixom (Debtor)

26-00906 Chad Nicholas Boone
#44 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Chad Nicholas Boone (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

26-00957 Deonte T. Harris
#45 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.

Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Deonte T. Harris (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

- 26-01015 Scott Allen Deling**
#46 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.
- Candace Arroyo, Atty for Scott Allen Deling (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
-
- 26-00267 Aaron Scott Bergakker**
#47 Confirmation Hearing Re: Chapter 13 Plan - Adj.
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Aaron Scott Bergakker (Debtor)
-
- 24-01820 Allen R. Bitson and Sydra S. Bitson**
#48 Trustee's Motion to Re-Convert to Chapter 7 (DN 81) - Adj.
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
Marcia R. Meoli, Atty for Marcia R. Meoli (Trustee)
Robert A. Stariha, Atty for Allen R. Bitson (Debtor)
Robert A. Stariha, Atty for Sydra S. Bitson (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

- 24-02931 Adrian Pavelescu**
- #49 Debtor's Objection to Claim No. 1 Filed by First
 National Bank of Omaha (DN 44) - Adj.**
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
 Michael M. Malinowski, Atty for Adrian Pavelescu (Debtor)
-
- 25-03381 Alicia Joan Marvin**
- #50 Final Hearing
 Best Financial Credit Union
 vs. Debtor (DN 27)**
- Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
 Mary Saur Cohn, Atty for Alicia Joan Marvin (Debtor)
-
- 24-01953 Ashley Marie Bronsink**
- #51 Final Hearing
 Meadowstone
 vs. Debtor (DN 31)**
- Harlee L. Nowland, Atty for Ashley Marie Bronsink (Debtor)
 Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

09:00 AM

25-01635 Denise S. Shaheen and Thomas D. Shaheen

**#52 Final Hearing
Fifth Third Bank, National Association
vs. Debtors (DN 32)**

James R. Oppenhuizen, Atty for Denise S. Shaheen (Debtor)
James R. Oppenhuizen, Atty for Thomas D. Shaheen (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

22-01510 Kaylee Mei Jung

**#53 Petition for Interim Allowance of Fees for Attorney for
the Debtor Filed by James R. Oppenhuizen (DN 46)**

James R. Oppenhuizen, Atty for Kaylee Mei Jung (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

25-02912 Richard Jay VanderKolk

**#54 Show Cause Hearing
Re: Filing Fee - Adj.**

Allison Greenlee Korr (Trustee)
Richard Jay VanderKolk (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

10:00 AM

- 26-00980 Kalynn Marie Vasquez**
- #1 Reaffirmation Agreement**
 Hyundai Capital America DBA Kia Finance America
 Re: 2022 Kia Forte (DN 15)
- Allison Greenlee Korr (Trustee)
 Kalynn Marie Vasquez (Debtor)
-
- 25-01591 Dawn Lorraine Cooley**
- #2 Final Hearing**
 Motion for Relief from the Automatic Stay Filed by
 West Michigan Private Capital Fund I, LLC d/b/a
 Benchmark Capital Finance (DN 44) - Adj.
- Dawn Lorraine Cooley (Debtor)
 Emily Jo Gudwer, Atty for Thomas C. Richardson (Trustee)
 Thomas C. Richardson (Trustee)
-
- 25-03691 Michael P. Wasko**
- #3 Show Cause Hearing**
 Re: Filing Fee
- Marcia R. Meoli (Trustee)
 Michael M. Malinowski, Atty for Michael P. Wasko (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

10:00 AM

- 25-80078** **Kala Rose Benshoof
v.
Richard Jay Vanderkolk**
Lead Case: 25-02912-jwb Richard Jay VanderKolk
#4 **Plaintiff's Motion for Entry of Default Judgment (DN
9)**
- Jordan Valentine, Atty for Kala Rose Benshoof (Plaintiff)
Richard Jay Vanderkolk (Defendant)
-
- 26-90071** **Jacklinn Rae Brayan and Jeffery Simon Brayan**
#5 **Final Hearing
Motion for Relief from the Automatic Stay filed by
Genesee County Land Bank Authority (DN 9)**
- Jacklinn Rae Brayan (Debtor)
Jeffery Simon Brayan (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)
-
- 26-90071** **Jacklinn Rae Brayan and Jeffery Simon Brayan**
#6 **Jacklinn Rae Brayan and Jeffery Simon Brayan Motion
to Extend Automatic Stay (DN 25)**
- Jacklinn Rae Brayan (Debtor)
Jeffery Simon Brayan (Debtor)
Kurt A. Steinke (Trustee)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

**COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)**

11:00 AM

26-01463

Precision Manufacturing Group, Inc.

#1

**Final Hearing
Debtor's Motion for Entry of an Interim and Final
Order (A) Authorizing it to Use Cash Collateral and (B)
Providing Adequate Protection and Other Relief (DN
4)**

Steven Mark Bylenga, Atty for Precision Manufacturing Group, Inc. (Debtor)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)

01:00 PM

26-80007

**Artemio Coronado Esteban
Boies Schiller & Flexner LLP
Darwin Joel Fuentes Perez
Hervil Gomez Echeverria
Leonel Lopez y Lopez
Luis Gomez Echeverria
Migrant Legal Aid**

v.

**Emilto Gomez-Moreno
Lucille Jean Moreno**

Lead Case: 25-03125-jwb Emilto Moreno-Gomez and Lucille
J. Moreno

#1

Pretrial Conference - Adj.

Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Boies Schiller & Flexner LLP (Plaintiff)
Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Migrant Legal Aid (Plaintiff)
Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Artemio Coronado Esteban (Plaintiff)
Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Darwin Joel Fuentes Perez (Plaintiff)
Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Hervil Gomez Echeverria (Plaintiff)
Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Leonel Lopez y Lopez (Plaintiff)
Andrew J. Gerdes, Atty for Luis Gomez Echeverria (Plaintiff)
James R. Oppenhuizen, Atty for Emilto Gomez-Moreno (Defendant)
James R. Oppenhuizen, Atty for Lucille Jean Moreno (Defendant)

**THE HONORABLE JAMES W. BOYD, PRESIDING
CALENDAR**

Thursday, June 18, 2026

**COURT REPORTER: Digital
HEARING ROOM: Judge Boyd Courtroom (Courtroom B)**

01:00 PM

26-80023

Casey L. Bishop

v.

PA Investment Corp. v

SoFi Lending Corp

Lead Case: 25-03423-jwb Casey L. Bishop

#2

Pretrial Conference

Craig B. Rule, Atty for PA Investment Corp. v (Defendant)

Craig B. Rule, Atty for SoFi Lending Corp (Defendant)

Maureen B. Van Hoven, Atty for Casey L. Bishop (Plaintiff)